

Open Forum on Getting Published in your Journal of Choice

On navigating the stages of publication

Robin Lindsey

Sauder School of Business, UBC

47th Annual CTRF Meeting, Mount Royal University,
Calgary, June 6, 2012

Outline

Choosing a topic

Preparation

Writing the first draft

Length and originality

What to say and how

Where to submit

Journal rankings

Responding to editors' decisions

Choosing a topic

Early career. Derivative from thesis.

Later. Often comes naturally as follow-up to earlier work.

Create a folder or file, and add references and thoughts as they come. The gestation period can be long

Two important criteria for choosing a topic

1. Of interest and significance to the profession.
2. Of interest to you.

Academic freedom to work on what you want compensates (partially!) for the remuneration gap relative to the private sector.

Constraint: Whatever you do you should do well.

Preparation

Prepare a rough outline of the paper. Update and refine it in stages.

It is much easier to write a first draft when the jigsaw puzzle and the main pieces have emerged from the mist.

Content

See references in bibliography.

Length

Check *Instructions for Authors* at candidate journals.

Originality

Incentive to write the Minimum Publishing Unit (MPU). Drawbacks:

- Limited value added
- Burden on referees to read antecedent work
- Clogs the system. Should be taxed, not subsidized!

Try for a home run, not just to get on base.

It pays off in the “long run”.

What to say and how

Some priorities

1. Provide motivation

What is the purpose of the paper? (Other than to expand your CV.)

2. Clarity of exposition

“Translate it into English.”

3. Provide intuition for results

Results are often far from obvious.

The math itself may be of secondary importance.

Where to submit

Journals dominate books or conference proceedings:

- Extent and quality of refereeing: Provides useful feedback and certification
- Accessible by Internet

Conference proceedings

Fine if publication permitted elsewhere.

Where to submit (cont.)

Special issues in journals

Four possible combinations:

Regular submission	By invitation
Conference proceedings	On a specific topic

Pros and Cons of submitting to special issues

- + A special issue on a particular topic may attract attention due to critical mass and guest editor's overview
- Conference proceedings can be a mixed bag
- +/- Refereeing may be less rigorous than for regular articles

Journal rankings: Economics

Kalaitzidakis, Mamuneas and Stengos (2011)

American Economic Review
Quarterly Journal of Economics
Journal of Political Economy
Econometrica
Review of Economic Studies
Journal of Monetary Economics
Review of Economics and Statistics
Journal of Economic Perspectives
Journal of Economic Theory
Economic Journal

- Ranking of the top 10 journals is relatively stable
- Some economics departments value only top-rank publications

Journal rankings: Transportation

	Impact Factor	5-Year Impact Factor	Immediacy Index	Articles	Total cites	Cited Half-life	Article Influence Score
IEEE T INTELL TRANSP	2.844	3.302	0.133	60	971	4.3	0.579
IEEE T VEH TECHNOL	1.308	2.239	0.129	363	6060	8.2	0.722
IET INTELL TRANSP SY	0.367	0.367	0.121	33	15		0.047
INT J AUTOMOT TECHN	0.515	0.569	0.044	90	239	3.3	0.112
INT J HEAVY VEH SYST	0.209		0.045	22	31		
INT J VEHICLE DES	0.389	0.613	0.052	58	489	6.9	0.233
J ADV TRANSPORT	1.207	0.88	0.2	20	166	8.4	0.4
J INTELL TRANSPORT S	1.031		0.059	17	60		
J TRANSP ECON POLICY	0.721	1.091	0.091	22	510	>10.0	0.593
J TRANSP ENG-ASCE	0.665	0.78	0	57	903	7.5	0.287
NETW SPAT ECON	0.718		0.083	24	147	4.7	
P I CIVIL ENG-TRANSP	0.136	0.254	0	25	44		0.075
P I MECH ENG D-J AUT	0.342	0.513	0.011	181	643	5.9	0.145
P I MECH ENG F-J RAI	0.407	0.606	0	37	211	7.3	0.266
TRANSPORT PLAN TECHN	0.286	0.52	0	32	120	5.7	0.173
TRANSPORT RES A-POL	1.832	2.384	0.175	97	1558	7.4	0.951
TRANSPORT RES B-METH	1.874	2.593	0.321	56	2306	9.1	1.145
TRANSPORT RES C-EMER	1.082	1.878	0.273	44	705	7	0.597
TRANSPORT RES D-TR E	1.118	1.447	0.017	58	592	6.4	0.516
TRANSPORT RES E-LOG	1.27	2.468	0.282	71	735	5.6	0.863
TRANSPORT RES REC	0.259		0.028	703	4108	9	
TRANSPORT SCI	1.534	2.821	0.194	36	2068	>10.0	1.511
TRANSPORTATION	1.767	2.105	0.222	45	742	7.3	1.061
TRANSPORTMETRICA	2.043	1.622	0.071	14	61		0.785

Journal rankings: Financial Times 45 index

Economics journals (5)

American Economic Review
Econometrica
Journal of Political Economy
Quarterly Journal of Economics
Rand Journal of Economics

Operations Research journals (5)

Operations Research
Journal of Operations Management
Management Science
Operations Research
Production and Operations Management

On the “rankings mania” and other woeful tales of academia see Frey (2010).

Responding to editors' decisions

1. Accept without revision

Rare on a first round.

2. Revise and resubmit (major revisions, minor revisions)

Respond (politely) to every comment of every referee.

Bend over backwards to satisfy comments.

If impossible or impractical, explain as best you can.

Editors sometimes indicate that not every referee comment has necessarily to be addressed.

3. Rejection

Rejection rate >90% for some journals.

Correct minor errors and incorporate at least suggestions on exposition before submitting elsewhere. Possible that you will encounter the same referee.

References

- Frey, Bruno S. (2010), "Withering academia?", October 19, CESifo Working Paper Series No. 3209 (<http://ssrn.com/abstract=1694448> [February 11, 2011]).
- Hammermesh, Daniel S. (1994), "Facts and myths about refereeing", Journal of Economic Perspectives 8(1), 153-163.
- Hamermesh, Daniel S. (no date), "How to publish in a top journal: (I wish that I knew!)", [Powerpoint presentation]
<http://www.bus.lsu.edu/hill/writing/hammermesh.pdf> [June 5, 2012]
- Kalaitzidakis, P., T. P. Mamuneas and T. Stengos (2011), "An updated ranking of academic journals in economics," Canadian Journal of Economics 44(4), 1525-1538.
- Varian, Hal R. (no date), "Tips on writing economics papers" [Website with multiple references] http://www.bus.lsu.edu/hill/writing_economics_papers.htm [June 5, 2012]
- Vegh, Carlos A. (no date), "How to write a research paper",
<http://econweb.umd.edu/~vegh/courses/Econ396-397/Econ396/how-to-write-paper.htm> [June 5, 2012]

Contact information

Robin Lindsey
Operations and Logistics Division
Sauder School of Business
University of British Columbia
Vancouver
BC V6T 1Z2

1 (604) 822-3323

Robin.Lindsey@sauder.ubc.ca